

**The League of Women Voters of Greater Cleveland, Shaker Heights Chapter  
Library Operating Levy Evaluation Committee  
Recommends that the Board of Directors Endorse Issue 7,  
the Shaker Heights Public Library's Operational Levy,  
which will be allocated to repairing and upgrading the Library's facilities,  
augment operating expenses, and add year-round Sunday hours.**

**The Issue language as it will appear on the May 8, 2018 Ballot:**

---

**ISSUE 7: SHAKER HEIGHTS LIBRARY DISTRICT**

**Proposed Tax Levy (Additional) Shaker Heights Public Library**

**A majority affirmative vote is necessary for passage.**

**An additional tax for the benefit of the Shaker Heights Public Library for the purpose of current expenses at a rate not exceeding 1.9 mills for each one dollar of valuation, which amounts to 19 cents for each one hundred dollars of valuation, for a continuing period of time, commencing in 2018, first due in calendar year 2019.**

---

The League of Women Voters of Greater Cleveland, Shaker Heights Chapter Library Operating Levy Evaluation Committee **endorses and recommends support** for the May 8, 2018 Ballot Measure. The request for the 1.9 mill-levy is the first increase in 21 years (the community supported a replacement levy 10 years ago.) The levy would generate about \$1.5 million a year, with one-third of the revenue designated for operating expenses to offset funding cuts, improve services, and offer year-round Sunday hours at the Main Library.

Two-thirds of the revenue would be used to renovate and upgrade the Main Library and Bertram Woods Branch, which currently need \$4.1 million and \$1 million in repairs, respectively. Renovations would include: making the library more accessible and convenient for our community; improving spaces for young children and teens; enhancing space for and improvements in technology; updating meeting and quiet study rooms; and a new roof at the Main Library and updated HVAC and energy efficiencies in both buildings.

Shaker Library's current 4.0 voted mills represents less than 2% of Shaker's total property tax millage (and less than the percentage Shaker taxpayers contribute to support Tri-C's levy). The additional 1.9-mill operating levy would increase the library's percentage of total voted millage to 2.64%. For the owner of a \$100,000 home, the 1.9-mill levy will cost an additional \$67/year or \$5.58/month.

Almost two-thirds of the library's revenue comes from property taxes. Revenue from the State of Ohio declined 19% and revenue from the existing property tax levy has declined 18% since 2008. [Click here to learn how public libraries are funded in Ohio](#). In addition, the cost of living has risen 14% since 2008. In response to the reduction in annual revenue, the library has: reduced its operating budget in all areas, including reduction in staff; reduced its material budget for books, CDs, DVDs, and e-books; reduced hours of operation; delayed replacement and upgrades to computer hardware and software; and postponed repairs and maintenance of its facilities.

**For the purposes of this report, hereinafter the Shaker Heights Public Library shall be referred to as SHPL, the Cuyahoga County Public Library as CCPL, the Shaker Heights Public Schools as SHPS, and the Ohio Public Library Fund as PLF.**

## **Key Findings:**

The League of Women Voters of Greater Cleveland and the League of Women Voters Shaker Heights Chapter both have [Positions](#) on Public Libraries supporting this measure.

The SHPL has stretched the 1997 levy well beyond historic levels and is utilizing operational funds to maintain its facilities. This practice of relying on operational funds for maintenance, limits the Library to making only emergency repairs. While well-maintained, the Library's historic facilities continue to require [repairs](#) and improvements. Putting off needed maintenance and upgrades only adds to the overall cost of eventual repairs. The state of Ohio currently does not provide sufficient funding to adequately repair or improve the Library's facilities.

## **Oversight:**

Being a school district library means that the SHPL and SHPS boundaries are the same. The School Board, which is elected, appoints the SHPL board, and they are required to place SHPL levies on the ballot. In addition, they must pass the SHPL tax budget on to the county budget commission. However, the library board does not report to the school board in any way and neither they nor their committees have any oversight whatsoever over the library. The SHPL is an entirely independent organization. The SHPL does have a Finance Committee and the Library Board appoints a Fiscal Officer, who serves at the discretion of the Board, to be the disbursing officer of the Library. The Fiscal Officer is the Library's chief financial officer and acts as the Board's financial agent in library matters. The Fiscal Officer administers and manages the funds of the Library in accordance with the law and the objectives and policies adopted by the Board. The Fiscal Officer has the authority to administer, and is responsible for, the receipt, deposit, and expenditure of, funds; the internal control of library expenditures; and the documenting and reporting of financial activity. The Fiscal Officer is responsible for the Library's investment program and all Library banking functions.

## **Background on Funding of Public Libraries in Ohio**

Libraries in Ohio generate revenue in many ways, however, 96% of SHPL revenue comes from two sources: property taxes and the Ohio PLF.

The assessment of property value is controlled by the county. One might expect property tax revenue to be solely dependent on property values, however, the effect of Ohio House Bill 920 (HB920) passed in 1976, sets a dollar cap on property tax revenue at the amount raised in the year a levy is passed. The last SHPL renewal replacement levy (a tax levy that enabled the library to receive taxes based on the current valuation of all property including new development) was in 2007, setting a revenue cap at approximately \$2,700,000. Property tax revenue for the library does not automatically increase with higher property values. [The Cuyahoga County Fiscal Officer has published an excellent short explanation of how HB920 works.](#)

The PLF is calculated as a percentage of the Ohio's General Revenue Fund (GRF), which is generated mostly from state income taxes. The PLF is distributed to the local school district libraries according to their population served, last year the SHPL received \$1,480,521. The PLF is controlled by the state and has been reduced repeatedly since the 2001 recession, decelerating even more rapidly since the 2008 recession, according to the [Ohio Library Council Report](#). The statewide PLF funding peaked at \$496,458,342 in 2001. The state froze the PLF at \$457,671,290 in 2002 and then changed the percentage of funding to 2.22% of general revenues in 2008, resulting in a reduction to \$370,367,615 in 2009. The PLF troughed at \$344,252,252 in 2012 and began to rise in 2013 until the percentage was reduced yet again to 1.66% of the state's general fund. It would be reasonable to assume this may happen again in the future.

Library expenses, on the other hand, have and continue to rise with inflation since 2001. Salaries and benefits for employees who provide the library services constitute 70% of the library's costs. Materials and facilities expenses constitute 26% of the library costs.

The League of Women Voters of Greater Cleveland, Shaker Heights Chapter is concerned that these Ohio legislative constraints on library revenue in the face of rising inflation will require additional future levies unless the state laws are changed. Indeed, Appendix K of the SHPL Facility Options Study dated October 10, 2016, indicated the library general fund would still crossover to deficit in 2025 with the proposed additional 1.9mill levy. The proposed levy can maintain facilities and upgrade services in two branches for several years, but not indefinitely, without continued effort by the library board to increase revenue without raising taxes. Recent changes in federal tax laws aggravate this situation.

## Why Support This Measure?

**The SHPL provides significant services and support responsive to the interests and needs of the Shaker Schools and community**

- 1) **The Shaker Heights Public Library (SHPL) is an integral support for the Shaker Heights Public Schools (SHPS).**
  - a. **SHPS has the only public school International Baccalaureate (IB) program in Cuyahoga County. Like the SHPS teachers, the SHPL staff have been trained in the language and process used in the IB program to support the students' work.** The unique curriculum of the SHPS's Pre-K through 12 International Baccalaureate (IB) focuses on teaching students to think critically and independently, using an inquiry process involving logic and care. Librarians coordinate with teachers on the students individual and group projects and are available during and after school hours for assistance. The libraries' meeting rooms are used for student group meetings.
  - b. **The Libraries provide a safe place for students after school hours.** Shaker's Main and the Bertram Woods Branches are within walking distance to the Shaker Heights High School and Shaker Heights Middle School, respectively. This is an especially important resource for Middle School students as there are few organized after school clubs for these grades. There is an active teen center at Main with dedicated computer access. Both Libraries have been designated a literal "Safe Place" for youth where library staff are available to assist youth in crisis connect with a social worker from Bellefaire for needed assistance.
  - c. **With Mercer teachers, staff, and parents, the library houses the Mercer-Moreland Homework Center.** This partnership offers an after school drop-in homework space at Main Library for Shaker Residents K-6. The library provides space and materials for the teachers and tutors.
  - d. **The Library provides after school hours wifi access to students not only at the branches during open hours but also through a "hotspot" lending program.** Many Shaker residents, especially those in the Lomond and Moreland areas, do not have access to wifi other than through their phones. This makes it more challenging for students to complete homework and other school assignments.
  - e. **Library collaboration with CollegeNow Greater Cleveland enables the library to host free ACT and SAT prep courses for high school students.**
  - f. **Another Library collaboration, this one with the Shaker Youth Center and MyCom, provides after hours and summer programing and jobs for youth and teens.**
  - g. **The Library helps young families with early literacy to promote school readiness.** In cooperation with Family Connections, the Library hosts the Play and Learn Station. This is one of the first literacy-based playrooms in Ohio. In 2016, 7,497 adults and children attended The Play and Learn Station. The library branches and its children's librarians also sponsor story hour and other child/family centered programing. According to latest published figures, children's program attendance was 14,054.

- h. **The SHPL Early Literacy Specialist promotes school readiness through weekly visits to every licensed Shaker Heights pre-school and daycare center.** The Literacy Specialist brings rotating selections of developmentally appropriate books for classroom enrichment. Also, the connections the children make with the Librarian include on-site tours of the children's libraries and assistance with signing up for their first library card.
  - i. **Enrichment summer activities include the Library's support of Shaker Schools' SELF program (Summer Exploration Learning and Fun).** Last summer the Library provided over 500 books to 17 classrooms. One hundred children registered for new Library cards and 186 students were provided Library tours.
  - j. **Quiet study rooms at Main Library are used by tutors and community members.** At last recording 3,602 people used the study rooms. (2016)
  - k. **SHPL works with school librarians to supplement school offerings by providing books and classroom sets through ClevNet.**
- 2) **The Main Library serves as an anchor to the Moreland Community—from infants to seniors.**
- a. **Library meeting rooms serve as a community center for various Moreland neighborhood clubs and groups.**
  - b. **The library is accessible to residents through public transportation and is within walking distance for most people.**
  - c. **Library wifi and computer access is available to this neighborhood where service is unaffordable for many and where it is poorly served by commercial vendors.** A total of 103,934 in-library computer sessions were recorded in 2016. This reflects usage of computers by patrons living within and beyond the Moreland neighborhood.
  - d. **Community Engagement Librarians are actively involved with the Moreland Community, bringing library services to seniors no longer able to travel to the library as well as soliciting community engagement in planning programming.**
  - e. **On a monthly basis the Library partners with the City's Economic Development Department and collaborates at Moreland Meeting Nights.**
- 3) **Through collaborations with others, or on its own, the library sponsors needed community service programing.**
- a. **Offerings include Library-sponsored ESL classes, assistance with job search and life skills training.**
  - b. **With Cuyahoga Community College the Library offers free Aspire GED preparation classes.**
  - c. **The Library partners with AARP to host tax preparation assistance for seniors.**
  - d. **The Library partners with SCORE (Service Core of Retired Executives) to connect professionals offering advice/expertise to community members who are looking to start a business.**
  - e. **Last year 1,339 people used meeting rooms for business and social gatherings, clubs and special interest groups, public agencies, civic and professional organizations and study groups.**

- 4) **Unique to SHPL, the Community Engagement Librarians and the Local History Collection Library are actively building community connections.**
- a. **The Local History Collection includes the Shaker Buildings Database that contains blueprints and other planning and building documentation for Shaker homes and many public structures.**
  - b. **The Adult Services Engagement Librarian is a member of the City Human Relations Task Force. The Community Engagement Librarian is a member of the Sustainable Shaker Task Force.**
  - c. **Shaker Library Local History Librarian partners with the African American Genealogical Society and hosts monthly membership meetings.**
  - d. **Shaker Library has long partnered with the Shaker Historical Society and Shaker's Landmark Commission to present programs of interest to the community.**

## **Local Control of the SHPL provides a significant benefit to the Shaker community**

Having and maintaining local control was a significant consideration in the evaluation of the proposed levy relevant to the current and future operations and management of the SHPL.

An evaluation of local control inevitably raises comparisons to library operations under a merged system with centralized control. Although the scope of the Levy Evaluation Committee did not encompass a comprehensive study regarding inclusion with the County Library, the interviews conducted and documents reviewed provided sufficient information to include some comparative examples in our evaluation.

Local control encourages and facilitates a connection to and awareness of the special needs and interests of the community. Members of the Library Board are Shaker residents appointed for specified terms by the elected Shaker Heights Board of Education. Library Board members are our Shaker neighbors who are familiar with and utilize SHPL facilities and services. There is no guarantee or provision under which members of the Cuyahoga County Library Board of Trustees will be representative of all the communities served by the CCPL.

Local control insures local management of library budgets, operations, staffing decisions, employee compensation and hours of operation. It also provides flexibility concerning book, audio, and digital purchases responsive to the interests and needs of library users. Independent libraries generally provide more diverse offerings and collections, particularly relevant to Shaker's membership in ClevNet. Local control also provides the ability for making decisions responsive to community needs and requests for programming, particularly those that support SHPS IB curriculum, and use of the facilities for meetings and outreach to our diverse neighborhoods. It also encourages and allows for decisions for remodeling and rearranging existing facilities, such as projections by the Library Board to reconfigure the teen and young reader spaces in the Library and maintaining two library branches.

In contrast, budgets, staffing, purchases, facility uses and programming are all controlled and centralized under the County Library with a primary focus on parity between and among its library branches. In a merger agreement, any and all assets owned or controlled by the SHPL would be transferred in total to the CCPL.

The SHPL does possess and control a valued asset unique to Shaker, the collection of local Shaker history and memorabilia which can be expanded and enhanced over time. The future ownership and location of the Shaker history collection is an unknown in the event SHPL assets would be transferred to the CCPL.

We have evaluated that local control of the SHPL provides a significant benefit to the Shaker community.

## **ClevNet and Regionalism**

### **The SHPL's Membership in ClevNet is a Valuable Asset and Resource for the Shaker Community**

ClevNet was officially launched in 1982. The ClevNet consortium allows library users in one system to access and borrow materials from other member systems. ClevNet has about 45 member library systems with almost 180 branches and over 10 million items accessible, including the vast collection housed and stored at the Cleveland Public Library. ClevNet offers a tremendous volume of resources which may not be conveniently and economically available at all libraries. Statistically about 1 in 4 items at the SHPL come through the ClevNet shared catalogues. This sharing relationship allows SHPL to tailor its collection to the needs and interests of its library users, and to purchase and store fewer items, including digital, since the pooled catalogue collections open access to millions of items.

Pursuant to an economic analysis of the ClevNet consortium conducted by Driscoll & Fleeter in 2009 ([http://www.clevnet.org/ROI\\_study.php](http://www.clevnet.org/ROI_study.php)), “...there was a collective costs savings of more than \$30 million, which resulted from libraries being able to share cataloging services, administration, computer equipment and professional support, as well as to consolidate circulation.”

CCPL is not a member of ClevNet. Although, technically, Shaker residents could utilize ClevNet services at a Cleveland Public or Cleveland Heights-University Heights library branch, branches of those libraries are not within walking distance or convenient public transportation for Shaker residents. It cannot be assumed that all Shakerites, particularly students, own or have easy access to private transportation.

Therefore, we conclude that ClevNet is a valuable asset for SHPL users. Forfeiting membership in ClevNet would be a significant loss of library services and resources.

## **The Benefits of Having Two Libraries in Shaker Heights**

The decision to support having two libraries in Shaker Heights is inspired by the desire to create a walkable neighborhood resource for more than one area of Shaker Heights.

In addition:

1. The Bertram Woods branch library is a strong support resource for the Shaker Middle and Elementary Schools. It supports IB and other classroom assignments.
2. Bertram Woods creates a safe and productive afterschool environment for middle school students. We would need an alternative location for this if Bertram Woods was closed.
3. Bertram Woods is a safe and productive resource for infant and pre-k children. Encouraging reading at a young age is a desired outcome for Shaker.
4. If either library were to close, the schools or city would have to replace several of the services lost, representing a cost to the city and schools. The failure to do so would represent a loss to residents particularly in the schools and neighborhoods adjacent to the closed library.

**If Bertram Woods did not exist, the schools would face additional challenges and possible expense to replace the services provided by Bertram Woods.**

In having two libraries Shaker does enjoy a privilege (branches/population) with more libraries per population than anywhere else in Cuyahoga County (Chart below)

Library Systems in Cuyahoga County	No. of Branches	Population Covered (2010 census)	Population/ Branches
<b>Shaker Heights</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>28448</b>	<b>14224</b>
Cleveland Library System	27	388,000	14370
Cleveland Heights/University Heights	4	59777	14944
East Cleveland	1	17843	17843
Rocky River	1	20213	20213
Cuyahoga County Library System	27	632,061	23410
Lakewood	2	52131	26066
Westlake	1	32729	32729
Euclid	1	48920	48920

In November 2017 Cleveland passed a library bond levy that increased their millage to 7.8  
On May 8, 2018 Shaker Heights residents will be asked to raise their millage to 5.9



## Shaker Heights Public Libraries represent a small % of overall taxation

If the Shaker Library Levy passes, Shaker Libraries will receive 2.59% of overall real estate taxes. They are currently at 1.77%

	Voted	% of	Effective	% of
Shaker Real Estate Taxes	Tax Rate	total	Tax Rate	total
Mental Health/Health and Welfare/HealthService	14.05	6.22%	13.914095	10.38%
Shaker Heights Schools	190.48	84.35%	99.059669	73.92%
Fireman's Fund/Police Pension	9.9	4.38%	9.9	7.39%
Cleveland Metropark	2.75	1.22%	2.718302	2.03%
<b>Library</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>1.77%</b>	<b>3.839952</b>	<b>2.87%</b>
Tri-C	4.5	1.99%	4.456854	3.33%
Port Authority	0.13	0.06%	0.113078	0.08%
	225.81	100.00%	134.00195	100.00%
<b>w/library operating levy</b>	<b>227.71</b>	<b>2.59%</b>		

Source is the 2017 composite reduction factor from the County Budget Commission website

<https://fiscallofficer.cuyahogacounty.us/en-US/Schools-Local-Governments-Data.aspx>.

## **Shaker Heights Public Library Taxes are in the Mid-Range for Tax Rates for all Library Systems within Cuyahoga County**

There are 9 different library systems in Cuyahoga County.

Shaker library residential tax millage rates post May 8 approval of the levy would still be below Cleveland Heights/University Heights, East Cleveland, Cleveland, and Rocky River

They would be higher than Euclid, Lakewood, Westlake and the Cuyahoga County system

If May 8 levy is rejected, Shaker would remain in the middle third of millage rates

<b>Library Systems in Cuyahoga County</b>	<b>Residential Tax millage</b>	
	<b>2017</b>	
	<b>Tax Rate</b>	<b>Effective rate</b>
Cleveland Heights/University Heights	10.0	8.261432
Cleveland Library System	7.8	6.348493
East Cleveland	7.0	7.000000
Rocky River	6.1	4.671972
Euclid	5.6	5.600000
<b>Shaker Hts</b>	<b>4.0</b>	<b>3.839952</b>
Lakewood	3.5	2.353349
Westlake	2.8	2.661982
Cuyahoga County Library System	2.5	2.475507

On May 8, 2018 Shaker Heights residents will be asked to raise their library tax millage to 5.9

## **The Library Board Competently Considered the Option of Inclusion of the SHPL with the CCPL.**

Prior to placing a request for a library levy increase on the ballot, the Library Board evaluated seven options regarding the operations and management of the SHPL, including the option of inclusion with the CCPL. Inclusion is the statutory terminology for the process through which the SHPL could merge with the CCPL.

There is ample information, documentation and audit reports publicly available relevant to the management, operations, mission and Five Year Master Plan of the CCPL to form a basis upon which to analyze proceeding with a Letter of Intent requesting inclusion. The Library Board and the Levy Evaluation Committee also reviewed the Baldwin Wallace Community Research Institute Library Inclusion Feasibility Study completed in 2010 for the East Cleveland Public Library. (East Cleveland is the only independent library in recent history that has considered inclusion with the CCPL. After the study was completed, the East Cleveland Board of Education determined not to proceed with inclusion.)

The Baldwin Wallace study recommended seven action steps to initiate the inclusion process which would also be applicable to a merger study for the SHPL including:

1. The Board of SHPL would provide a letter of intent to CCPL requesting inclusion, with the understanding that inclusion requires the dissolution of the SHPL as an independent entity, and there are no requirements for SHPL to have a presence on the CCPL Board of Trustees, as is true for all communities served by the CCPL system;
2. A forensic audit of SHPL finances for a specified period of time;
3. A facility and maintenance audit on all facilities under consideration;
4. Deed and title searches on SHPL properties to determine ownership;
5. A legal search of potential liabilities (workers' compensation claims, tort claims, contract disputes, sexual harassment and civil rights violations) filed or pending against the SHPL. If liabilities are discovered, determination of how those matters should be resolved would be made by CCPL during the inclusion process or afterwards;
6. Verification of the process for transition of SHPL property tax millage from current rates to CCPL rates;
7. Determination of whether the decision for inclusion would be made by the SHPL Board or by ballot issue decided by Shaker voters.

A study of a proposed merger requires financial and legal investigations and analysis which may take an undetermined amount of time to complete with costs to be funded and/or shared by and between the SHPL and CCPL.

One member of the SHPL Board had served as a member of the CCPL Foundation Board. That experience provided familiarity with, knowledge of and insight into the operations, business

model and philosophy of the CCPL. The CCPL has system wide policies made in the best interest of the County, one of which is parity or equity among its branches.

The SHPL cannot anticipate any special treatment or consideration as a branch library of the CCPL absent the completion of an inclusion study, no commitments or guarantees can be projected by the CCPL concerning a CCPL library branch for Shaker Heights. However, it is a certainty that inclusion with CCPL would require a surrender of the identity, all assets and decision making prerogatives by the SHPL, which in all likelihood would be irreversible.

Therefore, we conclude that the Library Board competently analyzed the inclusion process and the impacts of a potential merger with the CCPL to the SHPL.

### **Other Considerations that Factored into our Process:**

1. Shaker Heights has one of the highest taxation levels in Cuyahoga County with an Effective Tax Rate of 135.324 in 2018. Tax rates may adversely affect the real estate market in Shaker Heights. That said, the City of Shaker Heights has undertaken a number of projects that may well increase the District's property tax base in the future.
2. The future impact and consequences of the 2017 Tax Cuts and Jobs Act on individual Shaker residents cannot be predicted or calculated. We are aware, however, that the new tax bill may impact some Shaker tax payers adversely, whereas some may benefit.
3. The cost of renovating older buildings, one of which is leased from the City, is a concern. However, in consideration of the carbon footprint associated with maintaining these facilities as opposed to replacing them, maintaining the older buildings is the greener choice. Existing buildings can be improved at a lower cost, both financially and environmentally, than would be required to raze and replace them.

The durability of older building materials and techniques (e.g. solid masonry walls) is often superior to those common to new construction (e.g. light steel framing and rigid insulation board walls), resulting in buildings with longer service lives.

New construction does not necessarily reduce overall maintenance costs in the long-term. Any building, new or old, will require periodic maintenance work (e.g. flat roof replacement every 10-20 years and window sealant replacement every 5 to 10 years).

Further, preserving historical architecture, such as the Moreland School, has been shown to have a lasting positive economic impact on communities including small business incubation, affordable housing, sustainable development, neighborhood stabilization, center city revitalization, job creation, promotion of the arts and culture, small town

renewal, heritage tourism, and economic development.

(<http://www.preserveamerica.gov/docs/economic-impacts-of-historic-preservation-study.pdf>).

4. The trends in taxpayer funding has affected all Ohio Public Libraries, particularly the reduction in PLF funding support. All Ohio Public Libraries face the challenges of capped or declining revenue sources while expenses continue to increase.
5. The amount of millage increase in the current levy *may* require the SHPL to evaluate a request for additional funding within 6-10 years. However, that projection would be in line with the 5-year planning cycle that most property tax supported government entities use to calculate budget and financial planning.

## **Conclusion:**

After extensive evaluation, the Library Levy Committee has determined that the proposed ballot measure is a sound investment with tangible benefit to our community. Voting for this levy means we are investing to renovate and maintain both branches, preserve our historic buildings, maintain local control, and access to ClevNet, an invaluable resource. The money raised will better equip the Library to serve the public now and in the future. Our local library is a community asset we have invested in for over 80 years and which is answerable to Shaker residents. For the small millage increase this levy represents, Shaker Heights is getting a very high quality return on its investment.

Respectfully submitted by the League of Women Voters of Greater Cleveland Shaker Heights  
Chapter Library Operating Levy Evaluation Committee,

Michael Baron

Anne Batzell

Frank Goforth

Lynn McClelland

Audrey Morris

Terry Stoller

## **Methodology of our Evaluation:**

The Library Operating Levy Evaluation Committee-League of Women Voters Greater Cleveland, Shaker Chapter met with:

**Amy Switzer**, Director, Shaker Library System

**Brian Gleisser**, Board President Shaker Library System

**Chad Anderson**, Former Board President Shaker Library System

The Committee for the Future of the Shaker Library represented by;

**Linda Lalley**,

**David Goldberg**,

**Marty Kolb**,

**Alan Melamed**,

**Cheryl Davis**,

**Mary Boyle**,

**Trent Meyerhoefer**

**Mayor Earl Leiken**, Mayor Shaker Heights

**Debbie Herrmann**, Fiscal Officer, Cleve Hts/Univ Hts Libraries

**Kim DeNero-Ackroyd**, Deputy Director, Cleve Hts/Univ Hts Libraries

**Juliana Senturia**, City of Shaker Heights Council Member

Library Board members:

**Troy Meinhard**

**Carmella Williams**

**Michael Bertsch**

**Doreen Katz**

**Tom Cicarella**

**Bryan Christman**, Treasurer and Chief Financial Officer, Shaker Heights School District

**Jeff Issacs**, Shaker Heights Board of Education President

## **Source Material:**

Source Materials: Articles, Charts/Tables, Documents, Material Provided at the request of the LWVSH Library Levy Evaluation Committee, Presentations/ Reports

1. Shaker Library Presentation to the Mayor's Financial Task Force, April 11,2015.
2. Shaker Heights Public Library Facility Options Study Presentation to the Board of the Shaker Heights Library, Final Report December, 2016  
<https://shakerlibrary.org/shaker-heights-public-library-facility-options-study-october->  
The LWVSH committee studied the whole of the Facility Options Study. The following appendices detail specifics of the committee's attention.

*Appendix A : Auditor's Report, October 2016*

*Appendix B: Facilities Assessment and Maintenance Master Plan, April 2014*  
*Appendix G: Proposed analysis of the Possibility of the Cuyahoga County Public Library Providing Service to the Shaker Heights Public Library District, 2016*  
*Appendix G: Triage Questions on the Proposed Analysis of the Cuyahoga County Public Library Providing Service to the Shaker Heights Public Library District, May 2016*  
*Appendix H: Summary of Responses from Cuyahoga County Public Library to Shaker Public Library's May 2016 Questions*  
*Appendix I, S-1: Assessment of Likely Operating Profile for Option 7, County Inclusion Prepared as background for Shaker Heights Public Library Board Retreat September 24, 2016.pdf.*  
*Appendix J: Bryan Dunn Budget Commission, CCPL tax levy information, Sept., 2016*  
*Appendix J, S- 4: Mapping Observations*  
*Appendix J, S-6 Shaker Library 2015 Financials.pdf.*  
*Appendix J, "S-8 CCPL Responses Summary.pdf.*  
*Appendix K: Financials.pdf.*  
*Appendix M: Community Feedback on Shaker Library's Facility Options Study presented to the Board of Trustees, December, 2016*

3. "Proposed Analysis of the Possibility of the Cuyahoga County Public Library Providing Service to the Shaker Heights Public Library District", May 2016. provided by Director, SHPL.
4. "Summary of Responses from Cuyahoga County Public Library to Shaker Library's May, 2016 Questions", provided by Director, SHPL.
5. "Financial Implications of SHPL's Seven Scenarios", Sept. 2016, 20-page report provided by Director, SHPL.
6. "Shaker Heights Public Library Facility & Levy Timeline March 2012-December 2017", provided by the Shaker Library Board of Trustees.
7. "Quick Facts About Your Independent Shaker Library", October 30, 2017  
<https://shakerlibrary.org/quick-facts-about-your-independent-shaker-library/>
8. Shaker Heights Public Library 5-year Forecast, pdf. included within: "Assumptions; Renovation Costs; Millage" and Table: "SHPL 2017 Budget Summary & 5-Year Forecast". provided by Director, SHPL.
9. SHPL Report "Housing a 21<sup>st</sup> Century in Shaker Library's Existing Buildings; Facilities Renovation Budget; Renovation Timing; Renovation Features/Benefits", February 2018.
10. Simon, Margaret, "From the Director" October 2015.  
<https://shakerlibrary.org/from-the-director>.

11. Simon, Margaret, "From the Director" December 2017-January 2018; February - March 2018 <https://shakerlibrary.org/from-the-director>
12. Cuyahoga County Public Library Master-Plan Facilities, [www.cuyahogalibrary.org/.../Facilities-Master-Plan/Facilities-Master-Plan-Details.aspx](http://www.cuyahogalibrary.org/.../Facilities-Master-Plan/Facilities-Master-Plan-Details.aspx).
13. Comprehensive Facilities Assessment, Cuyahoga County Public Library, [www.cuyahogalibrary.org http://cuyahogalibrary.org/About-Us/Facilities-Master-Plan/Facilities-Master-Plan-Details/Comprehensive-Facilities-Assessment](http://www.cuyahogalibrary.org/http://cuyahogalibrary.org/About-Us/Facilities-Master-Plan/Facilities-Master-Plan-Details/Comprehensive-Facilities-Assessment).
14. CLEVNET library cooperation, "Services to Member Libraries, Costs, 2017 Inter-Library Loan".pdf. revised Jan. 2018 provided by Director, SHPL
15. "About CLEVNET", <https://www.clevnet.org/node/2> .
16. Correspondence between Chad Anderson, Past President of SHPL Board of Trustees and Mayor Earl Leiken, January 19, January 22, and January 26, 2016.
17. "Recommendations of The Mayor's Financial Task Force Shaker" pdf. May 2016. [shakeronline.com/downloads/category/93-mayor-s-financial-task-force](http://shakeronline.com/downloads/category/93-mayor-s-financial-task-force)
18. "Library Board President's Statement to the Mayor's Financial Task Force", pdf. August 19, 2016. [shakerlibrary.org](http://shakerlibrary.org)
19. Shaker Heights Public Library, "Mission, Vision, and Values". <https://shakerlibrary.org/about-us/mission-vision-values/annual-reports/>
20. Shaker Heights Public Library "2016 Annual Report". <https://shakerlibrary.org/about-us/mission-vision-values/annual-reports/>
21. Shaker Heights Public Library "2016 Year in Review". <https://shakerlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2016-annual-report-revised.pdf>
22. "From the Director November 2017 Shaker Library Facility and Funding Update", October 31, 2017. <https://shaker.org/from-the-director>
23. Shaker Heights Public Library "December 2017 Financial Report" <https://shakerlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/Dec-fins.pdf>
24. Report created by SHPL Staff, Outreach Librarians and Local History Librarian detailing: Community Partnerships, Community Collaborations, Community Engagement Activities, Community Comments, Community Meetings at the Library, March, 2018.
- 25.. "Our Position", The Committee For The Future of Shaker Heights Library. <https://futureshakerlibrary.org/ourposition/>



26. Baldwin Wallace Community Research Institute Library Inclusion Feasibility Study <https://www.bw.edu/Assets/...research-institute/feasibility-of-library-inclusion-study.pdf>
27. Driscoll and Fleeter, "Economic Analysis of the ClevNet Consortium", 2009 [http://www.clevnet.org/ROI\\_study.php](http://www.clevnet.org/ROI_study.php)
28. Kennedy, Dennis G., Cuyahoga County Fiscal Officer "House Bill 920.", <https://fiscalofficer.cuyahogacounty.us/en-US/house-bill-920.aspx> Accessed March 9, 2018.
29. Ohio Library Council, "History of State Funding for Ohio's Public Libraries." <http://olc.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/History-of-Funding-02.12.18.pdf>
30. Finley, Kim, "How Two Large Library Systems Co-exist in Cuyahoga County, Ohio", (2010) Theses and Dissertations <http://utdr.utoledo.edu/theses-dissertations/837>.
31. The Cost of Renovating Old Buildings, [https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2016-12/documents/construction\\_and\\_demolition\\_debris\\_generation\\_2014\\_11302016\\_508.pdf](https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2016-12/documents/construction_and_demolition_debris_generation_2014_11302016_508.pdf)
32. Library Journal. 2017 spreadsheet: libraries with budget \$1-4.9M, out of 1436 libraries nationwide.
33. "Star Libraries", Library Journal. <https://lj.libraryjournal.com/managing-libraries/lj-index/>
34. Chart: "Library Systems in Cuyahoga County", Number of Branches; Population Covered; Branches/Population; Residential Tax Rate; Tax Millage 2017 Effective Rate
35. Table: "Shaker Heights Public Library Maintenance Budget Item Timeline Summary", Facilities Assessment and Maintenance Master Plan, prepared by Holzheimer Bolek+Meehan Architects and Thorson Baker+ Associates, April, 2014.
36. Table: "Shaker Library Revenue from Ohio Public Library Fund (PLF) and Shaker Heights Property Tax Levy", 2008-2017, sources from Ohio Library Council History of Library Funding & [History-of-Funding-02.12.18pdf](#) Table.
37. Table: "Shaker Library 2017 5-year Forecast and Budget Summary",pdf
38. Table: "2017 Shaker Heights Expenditures from Real Estate Taxes", 2008-2017, sourced from the County Budget Commission website <https://fiscalofficer.cuyahogacounty.us/en-US/Schools-Local-Governments-Data.aspx>.
39. Chart: Ranking of SHPL, sourced from "Find Your Library- LJ Index 2017, Keith C. Lance ( author) Library Journal <https://lj.libraryjournal.com/2017/12/managing-libraries/lj-index/class-of-2017/find-your-library-2017>.